

**PARENTING SKILLS** 

# Animal models of maternal behaviour: insights into our understanding the endocrinology, neurobiology, genetics and development of mothering

<sup>1</sup>Emis Akbari, PhD, <sup>2</sup>Kathleen Wonch, MA, <sup>2</sup>Alison S. Fleming, PhD, FRSC <sup>1</sup>Atkinson Centre for Society and Child Development, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada <sup>2</sup>Department of Psychology, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada August 2015

## Introduction

New mothers experience a multitude of physiological changes that under optimal conditions may function to prime them to respond 'maternally' to their infants. These perinatal changes include enormous fluctuations in the levels of circulating hormones and changes in brain systems known to regulate mothering in a number of species. In addition, there are changes in other brain regions that indirectly affect mothering-related behaviours such as how rewarding mothers find infants and their cues to be, their attitudes towards infants and parenting, their ability to be flexible and playful, to show good memory, as well as their levels of anxiety and depression. Included among maternal behaviours in humans are feeding or nursing, providing safety and warmth, and expression of 'sensitive' and contingent interactions with their infants and, often, positive feelings of nurturance. Under conditions of extreme stress, ill health, immaturity, and adverse early and present experiences, these maternal behaviours and the priming effects of physiology, are often altered or diminished.

Optimal caregiving has been shown to affect brain, behaviour and socio-emotional development of the offspring.<sup>1,2</sup> Children rapidly acquire new motor, verbal, socio-emotional and cognitive skills that are accompanied by changes in their parental needs.<sup>3</sup> As infants transition into toddlerhood, parents are expected to adjust their parental behaviours and strategies to not only comfort, but also to stimulate, direct and discipline their child. Positive and responsive parenting, that includes warmth and positive affect,<sup>4</sup> have been shown to enhance many aspects of child development and to help protect children from certain environmental adversities and undesirable outcomes; in contrast, lack of parental warmth and responsivity, along with hostile-reactive, rejecting parenting in the absence of a social 'buffer' (supportive relative, friend, or professional) are associated with behavioural problems, poorer cognitive outcomes, increased risk for child psychopathology, depression/anxiety and other chronic illnesses.

### Subject

Understanding the experiential, physiological, and neural regulation of normative maternal behaviour greatly informs treatment and intervention programs designed to optimize maternal responsivity in those experiencing parenting challenges. For example, factors such as postpartum depression, difficult child temperament, poverty, or marital conflict, may lead to alterations in maternal responsivity, in turn increasing the likelihood of problems in child development.

#### Problems

To understand what contributes to mothering, one can examine mothering behaviour at four basic levels of analysis related to causality and motivation: (1) proximal (hormonal/neural/genetic); (2) developmental (mother's own early experiences); (3) functional (survival of offspring); (4) and evolutionary. All contribute to our understanding, but none are complete individually when trying to understand a complex reproductive behaviour.

#### **Research Context**

Animal models of maternal behaviour have provided insights into our understanding of the endocrinology, neurobiology, genetics and development of mothering.<sup>5,6</sup> By also providing models of parental-like behaviours among non-mothers (females that have not given birth), animal studies also illustrate how parental behaviour, albeit in the absence of lactation, may develop through simple extended exposure to young and in the absence of effects of hormones.<sup>7</sup> Recently, studies have begun to translate what we have learned from non-human models of mothering behaviour and examine whether similar principles govern the psychobiology of human mothering.<sup>8</sup> Early studies suggest that they do. This body of work uses diverse methodology, including hormonal measures<sup>9,10</sup> genotyping<sup>11,12</sup> questionnaires,<sup>13,14,15</sup> and behavioural quantification of parenting<sup>10,16,17</sup>, all of which have demonstrated excellent validity and reliability. With advances in human neuroimaging techniques such as fMRI and fNIRS, we have begun to ask some of the same questions of structural and functional neuroanatomy that we have been asking in animals.<sup>18</sup> As well, we have made considerable progress in our understanding of human mothering by combining insights gained by various fields including using novel statistical methods which make it easier to model the complex interactions among multiple sources of influences on mothering.

#### **Key Research Questions**

- 1. What are the hormonal, neural, genetic, and experiential bases of mothering behaviour in the animal model? What do we know about similar mechanisms in humans?
- <sup>2.</sup> What are the social determinants of mothering behaviour in humans?
- <sup>3.</sup> How does early life experience impact mothering behaviour?
- 4. What are the trans-generational effects of maternal behaviour in both animals and humans?
- 5. How does mothering behaviour mediate child outcomes in non-normative situations, such as in high-risk environments?

### **Recent Research Results**

Around the time of birth in most mammals, changes to the hormonal milieu including fluctuating levels of estrogen,<sup>19,20</sup> progesterone<sup>19,20</sup>, prolactin<sup>21</sup> and oxytocin<sup>22</sup> trigger a cascade of neurological adaptations that result in typical maternal behaviour.<sup>23</sup> Numan, and colleagues,<sup>24-29</sup> have demonstrated that the neurobiology of mothering in rodents relies heavily on projections from the

medial preoptic area of the hypothalamus and bed nucleus of the stria terminalis, as well as fibres from surrounding sensory, limbic and cortical systems. Both hormones and sensory input act on these brain systems. Furthermore, studies have consistently shown that the neurotransmitter dopamine acts on various psychobiological systems to affect the expression of species typical maternal behaviour in both mothers who have given birth, and non-mothers who demonstrate materal behaviours through repeated exposure to young.<sup>30-34</sup> New mothers with minimal experience develop an attraction to, and recognition of, their own infants, their odours, cries and visual characteristics;<sup>35</sup> and hence, infants and their cues become rewarding to the mother.<sup>36</sup> Mothers also undergo a change in their emotional states, being more anxious and more often attentive to infants, and to threats to the infant;<sup>37,38</sup> they show greater attentional flexibility and working memory. These psychological changes enhance maternal behaviour towards the infant. The guality of mothering is also affected by her environment, her stress,<sup>39,40</sup> and her recent and early experiences.<sup>38,41</sup> These environmental influences affect and interact with maternal genes.<sup>42,43</sup> For instance, a mother's own experiences being mothered interact with her genes resulting in epigenetic (environmental influences that turn genes on and off ) modification of her expressed mothering behaviour.<sup>11,12,17,44-46</sup> Enhancing the quality of mothering behaviour can help improve child outcome later in life. This is particularly true for children in adverse circumstances. Responsive parenting has been shown to help buffer children who are at risk of poor developmental outcomes because of genetic vulnerability,<sup>47</sup> low birth weight,48 low socioeconomic status, or cumulative environmental risk,49-51

#### **Research Gaps**

Notable gaps in research on mothering behaviour include:

- 1. How does parental behaviour and the brain change across the lifespan of a child? What changes do we see from parenthood to grandparenthood?
- 2. Similar neurobiological systems that mediate other motivated behaviours (e.g., eating, sexual behaviour) are active in a new mother. Is there a state of maternal satiety similar to other motivated behaviours? Are there similar addictive properties?
- 3. From rodent models, the approach/avoidance theory of maternal behaviour suggests that neuroendocrine changes associated with parturition trigger a reduction in the aversive response of mothers towards pups while simultaneously provoking approach behaviours. Thus, the same neural substrates that lead a mother to respond maternally may be involved in aversive responses to infants. Can this theory inform our understanding of parenting in

high-risk samples?

#### Implications for Parents, Services and Policy

Making conceptual associations between animal and human maternal behaviours is the principal challenge for scientists. Consequent testing of these associations is simpler yet equally valuable. What elements of an animal's maternal behaviour is unique to the animal, and what elements are part of a basic rule that can be transferable or applied to humans are important to determine. The integration of animal and human literature will lead to a better comprehension of maternal response and behaviour and will afford us more scientific understanding of its distinct and common expression in all species that engage in it.

#### References

- 1. Meaney MJ. Maternal care, gene expression, and the transmission of individual difference in stress reactivity across generations. *Annual Review of Neuroscience* 2001;24:1161-1192.
- 2. Ainsworth MS. Infant-mother attachment. American Psychologist 1979;34(10):932-937.
- 3. Barnard KE, Solchany JE. Mothering. In: Bornstein MH, ed. *Handbook of parenting: Vol.3. Being and becoming a parent. 2nd ed.* Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum; 2002:3-25.
- 4. Davidov M, Grusec JE. Understanding the link of parental responsiveness to distress and warmth to child outcome. *Child Development* 2006;77(1):44-58.
- Olazábal DE, Pereira M, Agrati D, Ferreira A, Fleming AS, González-Mariscal G, Lévy F, Lucion AB, Morrell JI, Numan M, Uriarte N. Flexibility and adaptation of the neural substrate that supports maternal behavior in mammals. *Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Reviews* 2013;37(8):1875-1892.
- Olazábal DE, Pereira M, Agrati D, Ferreira A, Fleming AS, González-Mariscal G, Lévy F, Lucion AB, Morrell JI, Numan M, Uriarte N. New theoretical and experimental approaches on maternal motivation in mammals. *Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Reviews* 2013;37(8):1860-1874.
- 7. Fleming AS, Rosenblatt JS. Maternal behavior in the virgin and lactating rat. *Journal of Comparative and Physiological Psychology* 1974;86(5):957-972.
- Barrett J, Fleming AS. Annual Research Review: All mothers are not created equal: neural and psychobiological perspectives on mothering and the importance of individual differences. *The Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry* 2011;52(4):368-397.
- 9. Fleming AS, Steiner M, Corter C. Cortisol, Hedonics, and Maternal Responsiveness in Human Mothers. *Hormones and Behavior* 1997;2(2):85-98.
- 10. Gonzalez A, Jenkins J, Steiner M, Fleming AS. Maternal Early Life Experiences and Parenting: The Mediating Role of Cortisol and Executive Function. *Journal of the American Academy of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry* 2012;51(7):673-682.
- Mileva-Seitz V1, Steiner M, Atkinson L, Meaney MJ, Levitan R, Kennedy JL, Sokolowski MB, Fleming AS. Interaction between Oxytocin Genotypes and Early Experience Predicts Quality of Mothering and Postpartum Mood. *PLoS ONE* 2013;8(4):e61443.
- 12. Jonas W1, Mileva-Seitz V, Girard AW, Bisceglia R, Kennedy JL, Sokolowski M, Meaney MJ, Fleming AS, Steiner M; MAVAN Research Team. Genetic variation in oxytocin rs2740210 and early adversity associated with postpartum depression and

breastfeeding duration. Genes, Brain and Behavior 2013;12(7):681-694.

- 13. Fleming AS, Klein E, Corter C. The Effects of a Social Support Group on Depression, Maternal Attitudes and Behavior in New Mothers. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, 1992;33(4):685-698.
- 14. Giardino J, Gonzalez A, Steiner M, Fleming AS. Effects of motherhood on physiological and subjective responses to infant cries in teenage mothers: A comparison with non-mothers and adult mothers. *Hormones and Behavior* 2008;53(1):149-158.
- 15. Meunier JC, Wade M, Jenkins JM. Mothers' differential parenting and children's behavioural outcomes: Exploring the moderating role of family and social context. *Infant and Child Development* 2012;21(1):107-133.
- Chico E, Gonzalez A, Ali N, Steiner M, Fleming AS. Executive function and mothering: Challenges faced by teenage mothers. Developmental Psychobiology 2014;56(5):1027-1035. doi: 10.1002/dev.21185.
- Mileva-Seitz V, Kennedy J, Atkinson L, Steiner M, Levitan R, Matthews SG, Meaney MJ, Sokolowski MB, Fleming AS. Serotonin transporter allelic variation in mothers predicts maternal sensitivity, behavior and attitudes toward 6-month-old infants. *Genes, Brain, and Behavior* 2011;10(3):325-333.
- 18. Barrett J, Wonch KE, Gonzalez A, Ali N, Steiner M, Hall GB, Fleming AS. Maternal affect and quality of parenting experiences are related to amygdala response to infant faces. *Social Neuroscience* 2012;7(3):252-268.
- 19. Liggins GC, Fairclough RJ, Grieves SA, Kendall JZ, Knox BS. The mechanism of initiation of parturition in the ewe. *Recent Progress in Hormones Research* 1973;29: 111-159.
- 20. Challis JRG, Lye SJ. Parturition. In: Knobil E, Neil J, eds. *The physiology of reproduction*. New York: Raven Press; 1994:985–1031.
- 21. Amenomori Y, Chen CL, Meites J. Serum Prolactin Levels in Rats During Different Reproductive States. *Endocrinology* 1970;86(3):506–510.
- 22. Higuchi T, Honda K, Fukuoka T, Negro H, Wakabayaski K. Release of oxytocin during suckling and parturition in the rat. Journal of Endocrinology 1985;105:339-346.
- 23. Numan M, Fleming AS, Levy F. Maternal behavior. In: Neill JD, ed. *Knobil and Neill's Physiology of Reproduction*. Oxford: Academic Press; 2006:1921–1994.
- 24. Numan M. Hypothalamic Neural Circuits Regulating Maternal Responsiveness Toward Infants. *Behavioral Cognitive Neuroscience Reviews* 2006;5(4):163-190.
- 25. Fleming AS, Vaccarino F, Luebke C. Amygdaloid inhibition of maternal behavior in the nulliparous female rat. *Physiology and Behavior* 1980;25(5):731-743.
- Fleming AS. Walsh C. Neuropsychology of maternal behavior in the rat: c-fos expression during mother-litter interactions. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 1994;19(5-7):429-443.
- 27. Fleming AS, Suh EJ, Korsmit M, Rusak B. Activation of Fos-like immunoreactivity in the medial preoptic area and limbic structures of maternal and social interactions in rats. *Behavioural Neuroscience* 1994;108(4):724-734.
- 28. Sheehan TP, Cirrito J, Numan MJ, Numan M. Using c-Fos immunocytochemistry to identify forebrain regions that may inhibit maternal behavior in rats. *Behavioural Neuroscience* 2000;114(2):337-352.
- Sheehan T, Paul M, Amaral E, Numan MJ, Numan M. Evidence that the medial amygdala projects to the anterior/ventromedial hypothalamic nuclei to inhibit maternal behavior in rats. *Neuroscience* 2001;106(2):341-356.
- 30. Afonso VM, King SJ, Novakov M, Burton CL, Fleming AS. Accumbal dopamine function in postpartum rats that were raised without their mothers. *Hormones and Behavior* 2011;60(5):632-643.
- 31. Afonso VM, King SJ, Chaterjee D, Fleming AS. Hormones that increase maternal responsiveness affect accumbal dopaminergic responses to pup- and food-stimuli in the female rat. *Hormones and Behavior* 2009;56(1):11-23.

- 32. Champagne FA, Chretien P, Stevenson CW, Zhang TY, Gratton A, Meaney MJ. Variations in nucleus accumbens dopamine associated with individual differences in maternal behavior in the rat. *Journal of Neuroscience* 2004;24(17):4113-4123.
- 33. Hansen S, Bergvall AH, Nyiredi S. Interaction with pups enhances dopamine release in the ventral striatum of maternal rats: A microdialysis study. *Pharmacology, Biochemistry, and Behavior* 1993;43(4):673-676.
- 34. Numan M, Insel TR. The Neurobiology of Parental Behaviour. Springer-Verlag: New York; 2003.
- 35. Fleming AS, Grusec J, Daley D, eds. Parenting, Science, and Practice. Special Issue to Parenting Science and Practice entitled The Arc of Parenting: From Epigenomes to Ethics. 2012; vols 3-4.
- 36. Strathearn L, Li J, Fonagy P, Montague PR. What's in a Smile? Maternal Brain Responses to Infant Facial Cues. *Pediatrics* 2008;122(1):40-51.
- 37. Fleming AS, Ruble DN, Flett GL, Shaul DL. Postpartum adjustment in first-time mothers: Relations between mood, maternal attitudes, and mother-infant interactions. *Developmental Psychology* 1988;24(1):71-81.
- 38. Agrati D, Brown D, Jonas W, Meaney M, Atkinson L, Steiner M, Fleming AS. Maternal anxiety from pregnancy to 2 years postpartum: transactional patterns of maternal early adversity and child temperament. *Archives of Women's Mental Health*, epub ahead of print. 2015.
- 39. Crinic KA, Greenberg MT, Robinson NM Ragozin AS. Maternal stress and social support: Effects on the mother-infant relationship from birth to eighteen months. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry* 1984;54(2):224-235.
- 40. Crnic KA, Gaze C, Hoffman C. Cumulative parenting stress across the preschool period: relations to maternal parenting and child behaviour at age 5. Infant and Child Development 2005;14(2):117-132.
- 41. Madigan S, Wade M, Lamondon A, Jenkins J. Maternal abuse history, postpartum depression, and parenting: links with preschoolers' internalizing problems. *Infant Mental Health* 2015;36(2):146-155.
- 42. Bouvette-Turcot AA, Fleming AS, Wazana A, Sokolowski MB, Gaudreau H, Gonzalez A, Deslauriers J, Kennedy JL, Steiner M, Meaney MJ; MAVAN Research Team. Maternal childhood adversity and child temperament: An association moderated by child 5-HTTLPR genotype. *Genes, Brain, and Behavior*, epub ahead of print. 2015.
- 43. Jonas W, Mileva-Seitz V, Girard AW, Bisceglia R, Kennedy JL, Sokolowski M, Meaney MJ, Fleming AS, Steiner M; MAVAN Research Team. Genetic variation in oxytocin rs2740210 and early adversity associated with postpartum depression and breastfeeding duration. *Genes, Brain, and Behavior* 2013;12(7):681-694.
- 44. Champagne FA, Curley JP. Epigenetic mechanisms mediating the long-term effects of maternal care on development. *Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Reviews* 2009;33(4):593-600.
- 45. Mileva-Seitz V, Fleming AS, Meaney MJ, Mastroianni A, Sinnwell JP, Steiner M, Atkinson L, Levitan RD, Matthews SG, Kennedy JL, Sokolowski MB. Dopamine receptors D1 and D2 are related to observed maternal behavior. *Genes, Brain, and Behavior* 2012;11(6):684-694.
- 46. Weaver IC, Cervoni N, Champagne FA, D'Alessio AC, Sharma S, Seckl JR, Dymov S, Szyf M, Meaney MJ. Epigenetic programming by maternal behavior. *Nature Neuroscience* 2004;7(8):847-854.
- 47. Caspi A, McClay J, Moffitt TE, Mill J, Martin J, Craig IW, Taylor A, Poulton R. Role of genotype in the cycle of violence in maltreated children. *Science* 2002;297(5582):851-854.
- 48. Landry SH, Smith KE, Swank PR. Responsive parenting: establishing early foundations for social, communication, and independent problem-solving skills. *Developmental Psychology* 2006;42(4):627-642.
- 49. Evans GW, Kim P. Childhood poverty and health cumulative risk exposure and stress dysregulation. *Psychological Science* 2007;18(11):953-957.
- 50. Evans GW, et al., Cumulative risk, maternal responsiveness, and allostatic load among young adolescents. *Developmental Psychology* 2007;43(2):341-351.

51. Werner E, Smith R. Vulnerable but invincible: A longitudinal study of resilient youth and children. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill; 1982.