

SOCIAL VIOLENCE

Collective Violence and Children

Joanne Klevens, MD, PhD

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, USA

October 2011

Introduction

Collective violence is any type of violence committed by groups of individuals or by states.¹ It is called social violence when it is used to advance a social agenda (e.g., the killing of street children by police, gang violence, terrorism committed by hate groups, structural racism), political violence if used for political reasons (e.g., armed conflict between or terrorism committed by guerrilla or paramilitary forces) or economic violence when advancing an economic agenda (e.g., terrorism by drug cartels, social exclusion of the poor).¹ For the purposes of this chapter, all three types of collective violence will be addressed given that the distinctions in the aggressors' agenda may be irrelevant when considering their impact on children's health. However, although acts of omission (e.g., states' depriving children access to education, health care, or other basic necessities) may also have serious impacts on children's health and development, the impact of this type of collective violence is beyond the scope of this chapter.

Collective violence may affect young children directly as victims or witnesses and indirectly through its impact on the availability, stability and responsiveness of caregivers and their environment.² Young children may be especially vulnerable to threatening situations given their limited cognitive or physical capacities to regulate their psychological response, reduce the threat

or remove themselves from the situation.³ The health impact of children's exposure to collective violence depends on the degree of exposure, the amount of caregiver support available during the experience and in its aftermath, and the amount of disruption in daily life and in the surrounding community.^{2,4}

Subject

It is estimated that more than 2 million children worldwide have died as a direct result of armed conflict over the last decade with at least three times that number being permanently disabled or seriously injured, 20 million homeless, and another million orphaned or separated from their families.⁵ Children exposed to armed conflict also have increased rates of mortality and morbidity from many causes (e.g., infection, malnutrition) other than injuries.⁶ Rates of mental disorders, specifically post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), depression and anxiety disorders, are particularly high among children exposed.⁷ In addition, over 4 million children under five were considered refugees, internally displaced, asylum seekers or stateless in 2009 due to conflict or risk of persecution.⁸ Armed conflict may also destroy or disrupt infrastructure (e.g., schools, health care, business, food production and distribution) and social cohesion, leading to insecurity, unpredictability and disorder in families' daily life, and rupture in the community fabric that supports healthy child development.⁹ Although fewer children are affected, terrorism (which includes bombings, hijackings, kidnappings, extortion)¹⁰ by political, economic or social groups can have similar physical and mental effects on children as exposure to war.^{2,4}

Large numbers of children are also socially excluded. For example, over 900 million people, many of these children, live in slums around the world.¹¹ Most are excluded from formal education, health care, transportation, electricity, sanitation services, potable water, secure tenure, political participation, safety and the rule of law, which increases their risks for communicable diseases, exposure to toxins, natural disasters and stigma.¹¹ Almost 900 million people belong to ethnic or religious groups that experience discrimination.¹² Historical conditions, inequitable social policies and unfair economic arrangements have resulted in a greater likelihood of Black and Latino children in the U.S. living in segregated and highly-impoorished neighborhoods.¹³ Exclusion or systematic discrimination of a population group creates chronic stress, increased risk of exposure to adversity and toxins, and reduced access to services, resources and healthy options, which leads to a multitude of health problems throughout the lifecourse.¹⁴⁻¹⁵

Problems

Research and intervention on collective violence are hampered by:

1. The lack of clear uniform definitions for some types of collective violence such as social exclusion;
2. The lack of reliable statistics on the number and characteristics of children affected;
3. Significant practical difficulties for collecting reliable data in the midst or aftermath of armed conflict;
4. Aggregated data that obscure the conditions of marginalized, homeless or transient populations;
5. Gaps in knowledge of root and proximate causes and the effectiveness of interventions to prevent its occurrence or ameliorate its impact.

Research Context

Although the research on the impact of collective violence is limited, it is informed by the abundance of research on children's exposure to other forms of trauma and stress such as child maltreatment, domestic violence and poverty. This research from the social, behavioural and neurosciences, molecular biology, genomics and animal models, clearly converge on the negative effects of serious and chronic adversity for young children.¹⁶

Key Research Questions

What are the underlying and triggering determinants of collective violence? Cross-sectional studies using large samples have identified correlates for the onset of armed conflict (e.g., poverty and inequity; political instability; weak democratic institutions; availability of profitable opportunities such as illicit drugs or mineral, metal or oil extraction amidst high levels of unemployment; existence of population groups that are excluded or discriminated against; war prone neighbours)¹⁷⁻²⁶ and terrorism incidents (e.g., poverty and inequity; repression of political or civil rights, migration and shifts in the ethnic, religious or social balance of a society; dispossession and human rights abuses; large numbers of urbanized, unemployed young men),²⁷⁻²⁹ however, because these are based on a finite set of incidents of armed conflict or terrorism, the consistency of these associations is difficult to test and the relative importance of different correlates is dependent on model specification. To the extent possible, systematic reviews are needed to identify consistent factors; more complex statistical analyses are needed to establish

the robustness of factors identified in isolated studies or with inconsistent effects (e.g., democratization processes, social exclusion, ethnically or racially segregated associations, natural disasters, resource scarcity and hoarding) as well as contextual moderators and mediators. In addition, the theoretical uncertainties as to the causes of collective violence suggest a need to continue identifying and examining new potential factors, especially underlying causes (e.g., cultural values, economic systems). Studies elucidating the causal chain of events or potential mechanisms would be useful to identify potential strategies and opportunities for prevention. In the case of social exclusion or discrimination, there are descriptions of the potential causes for their emergence in some communities and studies identifying their individual determinants but research identifying the factors that contribute to the maintenance of structural racism or discrimination is needed to develop interventions.

What types of interventions would effectively prevent or control collective violence? Some of the correlates of both armed conflict and terrorism are potentially modifiable (e.g., poverty, inequity, exclusion). Research on possible effective strategies (e.g., high quality early childhood education; full employment with adequately remunerated jobs; universal protection from income loss due to unemployment, illness, disability, old age, pregnancy, child care or care for disabled family members; universal coverage of health care, education, sanitation and water; redistributive economic and social policies; access to credit) to reduce poverty and inequity is growing³⁰⁻³¹ but more strategies could be identified and evaluated. Strategies to reduce social exclusion or discrimination (e.g., affirmative action, desegregation of schools and neighborhoods) in the U.S. have been attempted with mixed results.³²⁻³⁴ Other strategies with the potential to eliminate or reduce social exclusion (e.g., reduction of policies or actions targeting or limited to specific groups, universal provision of social protection and essential services of equal quality, cross-sector coordination in policies and actions, promotion and protection of human rights, promotion and support for genuine community empowerment, participatory governance³⁵⁻³⁶) need to be evaluated. Similarly, although there are studies examining the factors that lead to early intervention in situations of armed conflict (e.g., effects on civilians; previous mediation attempts; the intervener's security costs, relations with transgressor, and military and economic vulnerability³⁷⁻³⁸), studies evaluating the effectiveness and potential adverse effects of different interventions (e.g., sanctions, diplomacy, peacekeeping missions, military) are also needed.

What interventions effectively reduce the impacts of collective violence on children? Although governments and non-governmental agencies tend to respond to collective violence by providing

basic necessities and health care,⁹ not all types of collective violence are responded to (e.g., discrimination) and when there is a response, it is sometimes too slow, insufficient or inequitable. In addition, because caregiver functioning mediates and moderates the impact of collective violence on children,² community-and societal-level interventions that facilitate or support caregiver functioning should be implemented and evaluated. Finally, although limited research suggests that systematic preventive interventions are effective in decreasing PTSD and depressive symptoms among older children traumatized due to armed conflict or terrorism, only four have been rigorously evaluated and none have been developed for young children.⁴⁰

Recent Research Results

Conditions such as forced displacement, social exclusion or segregation, especially when leading to or compounded by poverty, can create severe, uncontrollable, chronic stress for young children which, if not buffered by safe, stable and responsive caregivers, can become “toxic stress.”⁴¹ Toxic stress experienced during sensitive periods of early growth impacts brain structure and function, recalibrating the threshold for activating the stress response system and disrupting the immune and endocrine systems and inflammatory responses. These stress-related changes affect attention, decision-making abilities, impulse control, emotional regulation and physiological processes that contribute to greater future susceptibility for emotional instability, anxiety and depressive disorders, learning disabilities, aggression, substance abuse, sexually transmitted diseases, obesity, asthma, respiratory infections, and heart, lung and liver disease.^{3,16}

Research Gaps

Developing and evaluating interventions to prevent collective violence such as armed conflict and terrorism from occurring in the first place should be a priority. However, because preventive interventions are based on the identification and understanding of causal factors and mechanisms, research utilizing a combination of historical, qualitative and quantitative methods is needed to fill these gaps. Interventions addressing root causes are more likely to have large scale and long-term impacts but the factors motivating governments to implement these potential interventions would need to be identified. In the meantime, researchers might also consider evaluating interventions to ameliorate the impact of collective violence on children. Factors contributing to the persistence and reproduction of the social exclusion of populations need to be identified and interventions to modify these factors are needed.

Conclusions

Collective violence includes any physical, sexual or psychological violence committed by larger groups of individuals or by states. Too many children around the world are exposed to different forms of collective violence such as armed conflict, terrorism, and exclusion, discrimination or racism. Young children's direct or indirect (through its impact on caregivers) exposure to collective violence has serious lifelong consequences for children's cognitive, emotional and social development, and physical and mental health. In addition to fatal and non-fatal injuries, collective violence can lead to increased risks for infectious and chronic diseases and increased mortality through various mechanisms such as toxic stress, reduced access to resources and services or increased exposure to risk. Because caregiver functioning may buffer the impact of these exposures on children, interventions should be developed to facilitate and promote safe, stable and responsive caregiving. Research efforts should focus on developing and evaluating interventions for the primary prevention of collective violence. These preventive interventions should be based on a better understanding of root and precipitating causes and their sequence in the causal chain of events.

Implications for Parents, Services and Policy

Parents can help buffer the consequences of children's exposure to collective violence by providing safe, stable and responsive care. Parents might also consider advocating for the conditions that would facilitate adequate parenting as well as prevent the occurrence of collective violence. Services should provide the support parents need to continue to provide safe, stable, responsive care to their children (e.g., adequate and stable shelter, a safe environment, sufficient food, clean water, sanitation services, health care including mental health services to address problems such as PTSD, and meaningful work). Policy makers should examine current and future policies to determine their potential influence on suspected causes of armed conflict and terrorism as well as their influence on maintaining discrimination or exclusion of subgroups of the population. Governments should protect all members of the society and assure equal access to the conditions needed for health.

References

1. Krug EG, Dahlberg LL, Mercy JA, Zwi AB, Lozano R. *World report on violence and health*. Geneva, World Health Organization; 2002.
2. Shaw JA. Children exposed to war/terrorism. *Clinical Child and Family Psychology Review* 2003;6:237-246.

3. National Scientific Council on the Developing Child (2010). *Persistent Fear and Anxiety Can Affect Young Children's Learning and Development: Working Paper No. 9*.
4. Pine DS, Costello J, Masten A. Trauma, Proximity, and Developmental Psychopathology: The Effects of War and Terrorism on Children. *Neuropsychopharmacology* 2005;30(10):1781-1792.
5. UNICEF. Child protection from violence, exploitation, and abuse. UNICEF. www.unicef.org/protection/index_armedconflict.html Updated January 31, 2011.
6. Carlton-Ford S, Boop D. Civil War and Life Chances: A Multinational Study. *International Sociology* 2010;25(1):75-97.
7. Attanayake V, McKay R, Joffres M, Singh S, Burkle F, Mills E. Prevalence of mental disorders among children exposed to war. A systematic review of 7,920 children. *Medicine, Conflict, & Survival* 2009;25(1):4-19.
8. United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. 2009 Global trends. Refugees, asylum-seekers, returnees, internally displaced, and stateless persons. United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees; Published June 2010.
9. Zarnegar Z. Separation and loss due to political and social conflict. *Zero to Three* 2011;31(3):52-57.
10. Jenkins BM. The new age of terrorism. Rand. Available at http://www.rand.org/pubs/reprints/2006/RAND_RP1215.pdf. Accessed October 4, 2011.
11. United Nations Millennium Project. A home in the city: Task force report on improving the lives of slum dwellers (2005). Available at http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/reports/tf_slum.htm. Accessed October 4, 2011.
12. UNICEF. *The state of the world's children, 2006. Excluded and invisible*. New York: UNICEF; 2006
13. Acevedo-Garcia D, McArdle N, Osypuk TL, Lefkowitz T, Krimgold BK. *Children left behind*. Center for the Advancement of Health at Harvard School of Public Health. (2007) Available at: http://diversitydata-archive.org/Downloads/children_left_behind_final_report.pdf Accessed October 4, 2011
14. Williams DR, Collins C. *Racial residential segregation: A fundamental cause of racial disparities in health*. *Public Health Reports*. 2001;116:404-416.
15. Williams DR, Mohammad SA. Discrimination and racial disparities in health: Evidence and much needed research. *J Behav Med* 2009;32:20-47.
16. Center on the Developing Child at Harvard University. The Foundations of lifelong health are built in early childhood. (2010) Available at: http://developingchild.harvard.edu/library/reports_and_working_papers/foundations-of-lifelong-health/. Accessed October 4, 2011.
17. Fearon JD, Laiton DD. Ethnicity, insurgency, and civil war. *American Political Science Review* 2003;97(1):75-90.
18. Collier P, Hoeffler A. Greed and grievance in civil wars. *Oxford Economic Papers* 2004;56(4):563-595.
19. Hegre H, Sambanis N. Sensitivity analysis of empirical results of civil war onset. *J Confl Res* 2006; 50(4):508-535.
20. Rustad SC, Buhaug H, Falch A, Gates S. All Conflict is Local. Modeling Sub-National Variation in Civil Conflict Risk. *Conflict Management and Peace Science*. 2011;28(1):15-40.
21. Cederman LE, Hug S, Krebs LF. Democratization and civil war: Empirical evidence. *Journal of Peace Research* 2010;47(4):377-394.
22. Bleaney M, Dimico A. How different are the correlates of onset and continuation of civil wars? *J Peace Res*. 2011; 48(2): 145-155.
23. Thiesen, OM. Blood and Soil? Resource Scarcity and Internal Armed Conflict Revisited. *J Peace Res* 2008;45(6): 801-818.
24. Cederman LE, Wimmer A, Min B. Why do ethnic groups rebel? New data and analysis. *World Politics* 2010; 62(1):87-119.
25. Cederman LE, Girardin L. Beyond fractionalization: Mapping ethnicity onto nationalist insurgencies. *American Political Science Review* 2007;101(1):173-185.

26. Østby G, Nordås R, Rød JK. Regional inequalities and civil conflict in 21 sub-Saharan countries, 1986-2004. *International Studies Quarterly* 2009;53(2):301-324.
27. Danzell OE. Political Parties: When Do They Turn to Terror? *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 2011; 55(1):85-105.
28. Piazza JA. Rooted in Poverty?: Terrorism, Poor Economic Development, and Social Cleavages. *Terrorism and Political Violence*. 2006;18(1):159-177.
29. Newman E. Exploring the “root causes” of terrorism. *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism* 2006;29:749-772.
30. United Nations Research Institute for Social Development. *Combating poverty and inequality: Structural change, policies, and politics*. Geneva, Switzerland; 2010.
31. Dow WH, Schoeni RF, Adler NE, Stewart J. Evaluating the evidence-base: Policies and interventions to address the socioeconomic gradients of health. *Ann N.Y. Acad Sci* 2010;1186:240-251.
32. Fischer MJ, Massey, DS. The effects of affirmative action in higher education. *Social Science Research* 2007;36:531-549.
33. Pickren w. (Guest editor). Special Issue on Fifty Years On: Brown v. Board of Education and American Psychology, 1954–2004. *Amer Psych* 2004;6:493-556.
34. Fauth R C, Leventhal T, Brooks-Gunn J. Welcome to the neighborhood? Long-term impacts of moving to low-poverty neighborhoods on poor children's and adolescents' outcomes. *Journal of Research on Adolescence* 2007;17: 249-284
35. Lawrence K, Anderson AA, Susi G, Sutton S, Kubisch AC, Codrington R. Constructing a racial equity theory of change. A practical guide for designing strategies to close chronic racial outcome gaps (2009). Available at: <http://www.aspeninstitute.org/sites/default/files/content/images/Roundtable on Community Change RETOC.pdf> Accessed October 4, 2011.
36. Popay J, Escorel S, Hernández M, Johnston H, Mathieson J, Rispel L on behalf of the WHO Social Exclusion Knowledge Network. Understanding and tackling social exclusion. Final Report to the WHO Commission on Social Determinants of Health, February 2008. Available at: http://www.who.int/social_determinants/knowledge_networks/final_reports/sekn_final_report_042008.pdf. Accessed October 4, 2011.
37. Commission on the Social Determinants of Health. Closing the gap in a generation: health equity through action on the social determinants of health. Final report of the Commission on Social Determinants of Health. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2008.
38. Rost N, Grieg JM. Taking matters into their own hands: An analysis of the determinants of state-conducted peace-keeping in civil wars. *J Peace Res* 2011;48(2):171-184.
39. Van der Maat E. Sleeping hegemony. Third-party intervention following territorial integrity transgressions. *J Peace Res* 2008;45(6):801-818.
40. Peltonen K, Punam RL. Preventive interventions among children exposed to trauma of armed conflict: a literature review. *Aggr. Behav.* 36:95–116, 2010
41. National Scientific Council on the Developing Child (2005). *Excessive Stress Disrupts the Architecture of the Developing Brain: Working Paper No. 3*.